Silly 10 Point Bonus: Suppose that f(x,y) = g(x), where g is the function defined on the real line by g(x) = 1 if  $x \neq 0$  and g(0) = 0. (a) Using the definition, show

$$\lim_{x \to 0} g(x) = 1$$

(b) Then prove that if  $y_0$  is any real number, f(x,y) does not have a limit as  $(x,y) \longrightarrow (0,y_0)$ . [This doesn't require use of the definition!] (c) Jeopardy: To which *natural* proposition does the pair of functions f and g provide a counter-example? Say where your work is here:

(a): Remember the definition?? Ouch. Proving that

$$\lim_{x \to 0} g(x) = 1$$

using the definition is truly easy. To this end, let  $\varepsilon > 0$  be arbitrary. Let  $\delta > 0$  be any positive number. We now show that this  $\delta$  has the desired property. If x is any real number with  $0 < |x - 0| < \delta$ , then from the definition of the function g above,  $|g(x) - 1| = |1 - 1| = 0 < \varepsilon$ . //

(b): To see f(x,y) does not have a limit as  $(x,y) \longrightarrow (0,y_0)$ , it suffices to compute the limits along the two lines x = 0 and  $y = y_0$  as  $(x,y) \longrightarrow (0,y_0)$  and observe that these limits exist and have different values. Evidently,

$$\lim_{(x,y) \to (0,y_0)} f(x,y) = \lim_{y \to y_0} f(0,y)$$
  
x = 0  
=  $\lim_{y \to y_0} g(0) = 0$ ,

and

$$\lim_{(x,y) \to (0,y_0)} f(x,y) = \lim_{x \to 0} f(x,y_0)$$
$$y = y_0$$
$$= \lim_{x \to 0} g(x) = 1.$$

Of course, if you want to, you *can* use the definition to prove the limit doesn't exist.

(c): Jeopardy! **Proposition:** If f(x,y) = g(x), where g is defined in an interval containing  $x = x_0$ , and

$$\lim_{x \to x_0} g(x) = L,$$

then  $f(x,y) \rightarrow L$  as  $(x,y) \rightarrow (x_0,y_0)$ .

Clearly, parts (a) and (b) provide a counter-example for this, and it appears to be a *natural* proposition that one might, at least initially, suppose to be true.